

ITEM NO.1

COURT NO.12

SECTION IIIA

S U P R E M E C O U R T O F I N D I A
R E C O R D O F P R O C E E D I N G S

Petition(s) for Special Leave to Appeal (C) No(s). 22450/2011

(Arising out of impugned final judgment and order dated 28/02/2011
in ITA No. 2630/2010 passed by the High Court Of Bombay)

C.I.T CENTRAL PUNE

Petitioner(s)

VERSUS

M/S VEENA DEVELOPERS

Respondent(s)

WITH

SLP(C) No. 24329/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 24330/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 24331/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 24332/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 24333/2011
(With appln.(s) for c/delay in filing process fee/spare copies and
Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 25000/2011

SLP(C) No. 25001/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 26010/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 26011/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 26807/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 27249/2011
(With Office Report)
Signature Not Verified

Digitally signed by
Meenakshi Kohli
Date: 2015.04.29
SLP(C) No. 27273/2011
17:12:08 IST
Reason:

(With Office Report)

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc.
SLP(C) No. 27671/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 27673/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28130/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28131/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28147/2011
(With appln(s) for exemption from filing O.T. and permission to
file additional documents and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28148/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28167/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28168/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28169/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28170/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28756-28757/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 29127/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 29128/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 30641/2011
(With appln(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and c/delay in refiling
SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 30642/2011
(With appln(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 30643/2011
(With appln(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 31278/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc.
SLP(C) No. 33053/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 34137/2011
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 3127/2012
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 3793/2012
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 6085/2012
(With Office Report)

S.L.P.(C)...CC No. 7562-7563/2012
(With appln(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 16627/2012
(With appln(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and c/delay in refiling
SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 19087/2012
(With appln(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 20034/2012
(With appln(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 20035/2012
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 21298/2012
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 21299/2012
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 21842/2012
(With appln.(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 23109/2012
(With appln.(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 27675/2012
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 31167/2012
(With appln.(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 31861/2012
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 31862/2012

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc.
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 31863/2012
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 31864/2012
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 36558/2012
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 788/2013

(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 789/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 790/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 1568/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 11270/2013
(With Office Report)

S.L.P.(C)...CC No. 12785/2013
(With appln.(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 16490/2013
(With appln.(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 16491/2013
(With appln.(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 16492-16493/2013
(With appln.(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 18023/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 18024/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 18025/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 18026/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 20409/2013
(With appln(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc.
SLP(C) No. 20534/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 21661/2013
(With appln.(s) for modification of court's order and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 21662/2013
(With appln(s) for modification of court's order and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 21663/2013
(With appln(s) for modification of court's order and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 21665/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 24961/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 26196/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 26197/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28449/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 28976-28977/2013
(With appln(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 30696/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 31709/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 32691/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 32693/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 32776/2013
(With appln.(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 34888/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 35907/2013
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 38202/2013

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc.
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 2766/2014
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 5699/2014
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 6770/2014
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 9132/2014

SLP(C) No. 9153/2014
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 9871/2014

SLP(C) No. 9873/2014

SLP(C) No. 10290/2014

SLP(C) No. 33433/2014
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 5766/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 5767/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 4652/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 5768/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 4680/2015
(With Interim Relief and Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 5769/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 5770/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 4651/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 5764/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 5776/2015

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc.
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 7575/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 7576/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 6452/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 7578/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 8390/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 8823/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 8825/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 8826/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 7570/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 7579/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 8827/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 8828/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 8829/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 8389/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 8218/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 8822/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 9943/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc.
SLP(C) No. 12107/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 12108/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 9942/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 12109/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 12063/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 10827/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 10805/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 10679/2015

(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 11349/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 12061/2015
(With Office Report)

SLP(C) No. 12106/2015
(With Office Report)

S.L.P.(C)...CC No. 11544/2013
(With appln.(s) for c/delay in filing SLP and Office Report)

SLP (C) No.10678/2015
(With office report)

Date : 28/04/2015 This petition was called on for hearing today.

CORAM :

HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE A.K. SIKRI
HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE ROHINTON FALI NARIMAN

For Parties

Mr. Gurukrishna Kumar, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Pritish Kapoor, Adv.
Mrs. Anil Katiyar, Adv.
Ms. Sadhna Sandhu, Adv.
Ms. Rekha Pandey, Adv.
Ms. Niranjana Singh, Adv.

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc.

Ms. Gargi Khanna, Adv.
Ms. Sneha, Adv.
Mr. T. M. Singh, Adv.
Ms. N. Annapoorani, Adv.
Mr. Subash C. Acharya, Adv.
Mr. Arijit Prasad, Adv.
Mr. Rupesh Kumar, Adv.
Ms. Kavin Gulati, Adv.
Mr. D. L. Chidanand, Adv.
Mr. Niranjana Singh, Adv.
Mr. Wasim Qadri, Adv.
Mr. Manish Pushkarna, Adv.
Mr. Ajay Sharma, Adv.

Ms. Anita Sahani, Adv.

Mr. B. V. Balaram Das, Adv.

Mr. Rakesh Dwivedi, Sr. Adv.

Ms. Kiran Suri, Sr. Adv.

Ms. K. R. Mishra, Adv.

Ms. Sanskriti Pathak, Adv.

Dr. (Mrs.) Vipin Gupta, Adv.

Mr. S. J. Amith, Adv.

Dr. K. Shivram, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Ajay Singh, Adv.

Mr. Nikhil Nayyar, Adv.

Mr. Dhannajay Baijal, Adv.

Mr. N. Sai Vinod, Adv.

Mr. J. D. Mistri, Sr. Adv.

Dr. K. Shivram, Sr. Adv.

Mr. R. Sivaraman, Adv.

Mr. T. Harish Kumar, Adv.

Mr. Atul K. Jasani, Adv.

Mr. Ajay Kumar, Singh, Adv.

Mr. Rashmikumar Manilal Vithlani, Adv.

Mr. K. Gopal, Adv.

Mr. Vikas Jain, Adv.

Mr. Shubham Rastogi, Adv.

Mr. Kamal Mohan Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Jatin Zaveri, Adv.

Mr. Neel Kamal Mishra, Adv.

Mr. S. C. Birla, Adv.

Mr. Ambhoj Kumar Sinha, Adv.

Mr. Nishant Thakkar, Adv.

Mr. J. Jain, Adv.

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc. 9

Mr. Ranjit Raut, Adv.

Ms. Bina Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Siddharth Bhatnagar, Adv.

Mr. Siddharth Mohan, Adv.
Mr. Rahul Arya, Adv.

Mr. Arjun Garg, Adv.
Mr. Shivanshu Singh, Adv.
Mr. Hashmukh Shah, Adv.

Mr. K. Gopal, Adv.
Mr. Salil Kapoor, Adv.
Mr. Vikas Jain, Adv.
Mr. Shubham Rastogi, Adv.

Mr. Kaustubh Shukla, Adv.

Mr. S. N. Bhat, Adv.
Mr. Anil Shrivastav, Adv.
Mr. Gaurav Agrawal, Adv.

Mr. Alok Dhir, Adv.
Ms. Vinita Sasidharan, Adv.
Mr. Gagan Gupta, Adv.

Mr. Sumit Goel, Adv.
Ms. Sanjana Ramachandran, Adv.
Ms. S. Lakshmi Iyer, Adv.
M/s. Parekh & Co., Adv.

Mr. Nikhil Jain, Adv.
Mr. Jatin Zaveri, Adv.
Mr. Navdeep Vora, Adv.

Mr. Krishnan Venugopal, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Rohan Thawani, Adv.
Ms. Vandana Sehgal, Adv.
Mr. Hardeep Singh Anand, Adv.
Mr. Anand Daga, Adv.

Mr. Parag P. Tripathi, Sr. Adv.
Mr. Rajat, Adv.
Mr. Pradeep, Adv.

Mr. T. Harish Kumar, Adv.
Mr. Sudhanshu S. Choudhari, Adv.

Mr. R. K. Patel, Adv.
Ms. Manisha T. Karia, Adv.

Ms. Anjali Malhotra, Adv.
Mr. Shivam Mishra, Adv.

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc. 10

Mr. V. Balaji, Adv.
Mr. Vinod Mehta, Adv.
Mr. Atul Sharma, Adv.
Mr. C. Kannan, Adv.
Mr. Rakesh K. Sharma, Adv.

Mr. Arjun Garg, Adv.
Mr. Shivanshu Singh, Adv.

Mr. V. Ramasubramanian, Adv.

Ms. Shashi Kapila, Adv.
Mr. Vikas Mehta, Adv.
Ms. Anushree Menon, Adv.
Mr. Sushil K., Adv.
Mr. Sanjay K., Adv.

Mr. Pravesh, Sr. Adv.

Mr. Rohit K. Singh, Adv.
M/s Mitter & Mitter Co., Adv.
Mr. Vinodh Kanna B., Adv.

Mr. S. Udaya Kumar Sagar, Adv.
Ms. Bina Madhavan, Adv.
Ms. Praseena Elizabeth Joseph, Adv.
Ms. Akanksha Mehra, Adv.
Ms. Srividya K. Kaimal, Adv.
Ms. Srinjan Khosla, Adv.
Ms. Swati Vellodi, Adv.
Mr. Laksh Puri, Adv.
M/s. Lawyer S Knit & Co, Adv.

Mr. Pradeep Kumar Bakshi, Adv.

Ms. Bindi Girish Dave, Adv.

Mr. Sudhanshu Choudhary, Adv.
Mr. Vatsalya, Adv.

UPON hearing the counsel the Court made the following
O R D E R

SLP (C)No.22450/2011, SLP (C)No. 20534/2013, SLP (C) CC
No.12785/2013, SLP (C)CC No.11544/2013, SLP (C)
No.21661/2013, SLP (C) No.21662/2013, SLP (C) No.21663/2013,
SLP (C) No.24961/2013, SLP (C) No.31709/2013, SLP (C)
No.34888/2013, SLP (C) No.10678/2015, SLP (C) No.28130/2011,
SLP (C)No. 20409/2013, SLP (C) No.21842/2012, SLP (C)
No.19087/2012, SLP (C) No.29127/2011, SLP (C) No.30643/2011,

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc. 11

SLP (C) No.9943/2015, SLP(C) No. 6085/2012, SLP(C) No.
25000/2011, SLP(C) No. 24329/2011, SLP(C) No. 24331/2011,
SLP(C) No. 24332/2011, SLP(C) No. 24333/2011, SLP(C) No.
25001/2011, SLP(C) No. 30642/2011, SLP(C) No. 28131/2011,
SLP(C) No. 30641/2011, SLP(C) No. 29128/2011, SLP(C) No.
28167/2011, SLP(C) No. 28130/2011, SLP(C) No. 28147/2011,
SLP(C) No. 28148/2011, SLP(C) No. 28169/2011, SLP(C) No.
33053/2011, SLP(C) No. 23109/2012, SLP(C) No. 31167/2012,
SLP(C) No. 28756-28757/2011, SLP(C) No. 21298/2012, SLP(C)
No. 27671/2011, SLP(C) No. 27673/2011, SLP(C) No.
27249/2011, SLP(C) No. 31278/2011, SLP(C) No. 26807/2011,
SLP(C) No. 28168/2011, SLP(C) No. 34137/2011, SLP(C) No.
26010/2011, SLP(C) No. 26011/2011, SLP(C) No. 27675/2012,
SLP(C) No. 5766/2015, SLP(C) No. 5767/2015, SLP(C) No.
5770/2015, SLP(C) No. 10827/2015, SLP(C) No. 12107/2015,
SLP(C) No. 35907/2013, SLP(C) No. 38202/2013, SLP(C) No.
6770/2014

SLP (C) No. 26196/2013, SLP (C) No. 26197/2013, SLP (C)
No.788/2012, SLP (C) No.31862/2012, SLP (C) No.36558/2012,
SLP (C) No.789/2013, SLP (C) No.790/2013, SLP (C)
No.11270/2013, SLP (C) No. 31863/2012, SLP (C)
No.31864/2012, SLP (C) No.30696/2013, SLP (C) No.32776/2013,
SLP (C) No.9873/2014, SLP (C) No.27273/2011, SLP (C)
No.28170/2011, SLP (C) Nos. 28976-28977/2013, SLP (C)
No.9153/2014, SLP(C) No. 1568/2013, SLP(C) No. 31861/2012

SLP(C) No. 3127/2012, SLP(C) No. 3793/2012, S.L.P.(C)...CC
No. 7562-7563/2012, SLP(C) No. 16627/2012, SLP(C) No.
20034/2012, SLP(C) No. 20035/2012, SLP(C) No. 21299/2012,
SLP(C) No. 16490/2013, SLP(C) No. 16491/2013, SLP(C) No.
16492-16493/2013, SLP(C) No. 18023/2013, SLP(C) No.
18024/2013, SLP(C) No. 18025/2013, SLP(C) No. 18026/2013,

SLP(C) No. 21665/2013, SLP(C) No. 28449/2013, SLP(C) No. 32691/2013, SLP(C) No. 32693/2013, SLP(C) No. 2766/2014, SLP(C) No.5699/2014, SLP(C) No.33433/2014, SLP(C) No.5768/2015, SLP(C) No.4680/2015, SLP(C) No.5764/2015, SLP(C) No. 5776/2015, SLP(C) No. 7576/2015, SLP(C) No. 6452/2015, SLP(C) No. 8826/2015, SLP(C) No. 8389/2015, SLP(C) No. 8218/2015, SLP(C) No. 8822/2015, SLP(C) No. 12108/2015, SLP(C) No. 9942/2015, SLP(C) No. 12109/2015,, SLP(C) No. 10805/2015, SLP(C) No. 10679/2015, SLP(C) No. 11349/2015, SLP(C) No. 12061/2015, SLP(C) No. 12106/2015, SLP (C)No. 9153/2014

SLP (C)No. 9153/2014 is taken on board with the consent of the parties.

Delay condoned.

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc.

All these special leave petitions are filed by the Revenue/ Department of Income tax against the judgments rendered by various High Courts deciding identical issue which pertains to the deduction under Section 80IB(10) of the Income Tax Act, as applicable prior to 01.04.2005. We may mention at the outset that all the High Courts have taken identical view in all these cases holding that the deduction under the aforesaid provision would be admissible to a "housing project".

All the assesseees had undertaken construction projects which were approved by the municipal authorities/ local authorities as housing projects. On that basis, they claimed deduction under Section 80IB(10) of the Act. This provision as it stood at that time, i.e., prior to 01.04.2005 reads as under: - Section 80IB(10) [as it stood prior to 01.04.2005]

"(10) The amount of profits in case of an undertaking developing and building housing projects approved before the 31st day of March, 2005 by a local authority, shall be hundred per cent of the profits derived in any previous year relevant to any assessment year from such housing project if, -

(a) such undertaking has commenced or commences development and construction of the housing project on or after the 1st day of October, 1998;

(b) the project is on the size of a plot of land which has a minimum area of one acre; and

(c) the residential unit has a maximum built-up area of one thousand square feet where such residential unit is situated within the cities of Delhi or Mumbai or within twenty-five kilometres from the municipal limits of these cities and one thousand and five hundred square feet at any other place."

However, the income tax authorities rejected the claim of deduction on the ground that the projects were not "housing project" inasmuch as some commercial activity was also undertaken in those projects. This contention of the Revenue is not accepted by the income tax Appellate Tribunal as well as the High Court in the impugned judgment. The High Court interpreted the expression "housing project" by giving grammatical meaning thereto as housing project is not defined under the Income Tax Act insofar as the aforesaid provision is concerned. Since sub-section (10) of Section 80IB very categorically mentioned that such a project which is undertaken as housing project is approved by a local authority, once the project is approved by the local authority it is to be treated as the housing project. We may also point out that the High Court had made observations in the context of Development Control Regulations (hereinafter referred to as 'DCRs' in short) under which the local authority sanctions the housing projects and noted that in these DCRs itself, an element of commercial activity is provided but the total project is still treated as housing project. On the basis of this discussion, after modifying some of the directions given by the ITAT, the conclusions which are arrived at by the High Court are as follows: -

"30. In the result, the questions raised in the appeal are answered thus: -

- a) Upto 31/3/2005 (subject to fulfilling other conditions), deduction under Section 80IB(10) is allowable to housing projects approved by the local authority having residential units with commercial user to the extent permitted under DC Rules/ Regulations framed by the respective local authority.
- b) In such a case, where the commercial user permitted by the local authority is within the limits prescribed under the DC Rules/ Regulation, the deduction under Section 80IB(10) upto 31/3/2005 would be allowable irrespective of the fact that the project is approved as 'housing project' or 'residential plus commercial'.
- c) In the absence of any provisions under the Income Tax Act, the Tribunal was not justified in holding that upto 31/3/2005 deduction under Section 80IB(10) would be allowable to the projects approved by the local authority having residential building with commercial user upto 10% of the total built-up area of the plot.
- d) Since deductions under Section 80IB(10) is on the profits derived from the housing projects approved by the local authority as a whole, the Tribunal was not justified in restricting Section 80IB(10) deduction only to a part of the project. However, in the present case, since the assessee has accepted the decision of the Tribunal in allowing Section 80IB(10) deduction to a part of the project, we do not disturb the findings of the Tribunal in that behalf.
- e) Clause (d) inserted to Section 80IB(10) with effect from 1/4/2005 is prospective and not retrospective and hence cannot be applied for the period prior to 1/4/2005."

We are in agreement with the aforesaid answers given by the High Court to the various issues. We may only clarify that insofar as answer at para (a) is concerned, it would mean those projects which are approved by the local authorities as housing projects with commercial element therein.

There was much debate on the answer given in para (b) above. It was argued by Mr. Gurukrishna Kumar, learned senior counsel, that a project which is cleared as "residential plus commercial" project cannot be treated as housing project and therefore, this direction is contrary to the provisions of Section 80(I)(B)(10) of the Act. However, reading the direction in its entirety and particularly the first sentence thereof, we find that commercial user which is permitted is in the residential units and that too, as per DCR. Examples given before us by the learned counsel for the assessee was that such commercial user to some extent is permitted to the professionals like Doctors, Chartered Accountants, Advocates, etc., in the DCRs itself.

Therefore, we clarify that direction (b) is to be read in that context where the project is predominantly housing/ residential project but the commercial activity in the residential units is permitted. With the aforesaid clarification, we dispose of all these special leave petitions.

SLP (C) No.8827/2015, SLP (C) No.9132/2014, SLP (C) No.9871/2014, SLP (C) No.8823/2015, SLP (C) No.7570/2015, SLP (C) No. 8829/2015, SLP (C) No.10290/2014, SLP (C) No.24330/2011, SLP (C) No.8390/2015, SLP (C) No.4651/2015, SLP (C) No.4652/2015, SLP (C) No.7579/2015, SLP(C) No. 12063/2015, SLP(C) No. 7578/2015, SLP(C) No. 8828/2015, SLP(C) No. 7575/2015, SLP(C) No. 8825/2015, SLP(C) No.5769/2015

List on Thursday 30th April, 2015.

(Nidhi Ahuja)
COURT MASTER

(Suman Jain)
COURT MASTER

SLP (C)No. 22450/2011 etc. 16